

Implementation of Fresh Food Certification Service Policy of Plant Origin at the Food Quality and Safety Certification Center UPTD in Bali Province

Wayan Aris Surya Darma^{1*}, Ida Bagus Teddy Prianthara²

^{1,2}Universitas Pendidikan Nasional, Denpasar, Indonesia

Jl. Waturenggong No.164, Panjer, Kec. Denpasar Bar., Kota Denpasar, Bali.

*Email Corresponding: arissuryadarma25@gmail.com

Article History:

Received: 02/02/2026

Revised: 25/03/2026

Accepted: 30/03/2026

Published: 04/04/2026

Keywords:

Policy Implementation

PSAT Certification

Public Service

Abstract: This study aims to analyze the implementation of the Fresh Food of Plant Origin (PSAT) certification service policy at the Technical Implementation Unit (UPTD) of the Food Quality and Safety Certification Center (BSMKP) in Bali Province. The data reveals a significant paradox: a large potential for PSAT production contrasts sharply with a very low and declining realization of certification issuance. Using a qualitative case study approach, data was collected through in-depth interviews with seven key informants (UPTD BSMKP officials, Agricultural Office officials, and business actors) and document studies. Data analysis employed Edward III's policy implementation model, focusing on four variables: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The findings indicate that policy implementation has procedurally taken place but remains ineffective. Key internal constraints include limited budgetary and facility resources, a partially integrated administrative system, and procedural complexities that hinder efficiency. More crucially, external constraints stem from business actors' perception that certification provides no economic added value, as certified products receive no price premium or special placement in modern retail markets. This study recommends an integrative approach that combines institutional capacity strengthening (through service digitalization and sustained technical assistance) with active market development strategies (through regulations mandating the absorption of certified products, collaboration with retailers, and collective brand building). Consequently, certification can shift from an administrative burden to a strategic instrument for enhancing the competitiveness of Bali's agricultural products.

1. Introduction

Food safety is a strategic aspect in public health development and supports regional economic competitiveness. In an increasingly open and competitive food trade system, fresh plant-based food products (PSAT) are required not only to be available in adequate quantities but also to meet quality, safety, and consumption standards. To ensure this, the Indonesian government has established various

regulations, including Minister of Agriculture Regulation No. 53 of 2018, which mandates safety and quality certification for certain PSAT commodities, particularly those circulating in modern markets and for export. At the regional level, implementation of this policy is carried out by the Regional Technical Implementation Unit of the Food Quality and Safety Certification Center (UPTD BSMKP), which serves as the competent authority for certification, registration, and development of PSAT business actors.

However, the implementation of the PSAT certification service policy in Bali Province demonstrates an imbalance between production potential and certification realization. Bali has a large and diverse horticultural production base, with leading commodities such as watermelon, banana, shallot, chili, and orange produced in significant volumes annually. However, the number of issued Prima certifications remains very limited and disproportionate to the scale of production. In fact, some high-yielding commodities are barely covered by formal certification schemes. This situation indicates that most PSAT products are circulating without officially verified quality and safety assurance.

A similar phenomenon is reflected in the performance of the UPTD BSMKP services in recent years, which have shown fluctuations and a downward trend in service output. The significant decline in registrations and certifications, particularly after 2023, indicates issues in policy implementation, both in terms of business demand and the effectiveness of public services. Despite indications of increasing demand for health certificates for export, the overall service trend has actually experienced a sharp contraction.

The disparity between the large PSAT production capacity and the low adoption of formal certification reflects a gap between policy design and implementation practices in the field. These constraints are thought to stem from internal institutional factors, such as limited resources, service procedures, coordination, and system support, as well as external factors such as low awareness, perceived cost-benefit, and the complexity of certification requirements for business actors. This situation has the potential to pose risks to food security, hinder local products' access to modern markets and exports, and weaken the competitiveness of the regional agricultural sector.

The policy's strategic objectives are threefold: to enhance product quality, to safeguard consumers, and to fortify the position of local products in contemporary markets. However, the adoption rate of PSAT certification remains relatively low in practice. A considerable proportion of businesses have not yet applied for certification, and some even believe that certification does not provide tangible economic benefits. This discrepancy can be attributed to the disparity between the objectives of policy and the reality of implementation on the ground.

The objective of this study is to analyze the implementation of the PSAT certification service policy in Bali Province. The present study has been conducted for the purpose of examining the implementation of the policy in practice and assessing its level of effectiveness. Furthermore, the objective of the present study is to ascertain the pivotal factors that influence the efficacy of policy implementation, encompassing institutional, administrative, and behavioral dimensions. Moreover, the present study endeavors to formulate suitable strategies to strengthen the implementation of the PSAT certification policy, with a view to making it more effective and enhancing the competitiveness of local products in Bali. The research findings are expected to contribute academically to the development of public policy implementation studies, while also providing practical recommendations for improving food quality assurance and safety systems, strengthening public service governance, and enhancing the competitiveness of fresh plant-based food products in Bali Province.

2. Literature Review

Public Policy and Service

Public policy is a state instrument designed to address collective problems and achieve social goals through a series of government decisions and actions. The success of a policy is not solely determined at the formulation stage but also depends heavily on the effectiveness of its implementation through public services. Public services serve as the operational manifestation of policy and are the primary means of transforming normative mandates into tangible benefits for society (Donny & Kurniawan, 2023). Therefore, the quality of service characterized by accessibility, legal certainty, transparency, and accountability is an important indicator of policy success, especially in technical policies such as certification (Sumaryanto, 2025).

Policy Implementation

Policy implementation refers to the process of translating formal policies into operational actions in the field (Mulyono & Hidayat, 2022). This stage is dynamic and involves the interaction of various actors, resource management, and adaptation to social, political, and administrative contexts (Putri & Suprayoga, 2023). Implementation does not always proceed linearly, as policies may undergo adjustments due to technical constraints or local realities (Intania et al., 2023). Therefore, implementation studies aim to identify gaps between policy objectives and implementation practices, and to uncover factors that influence policy outcomes in the context of public services (Rayhan et al., 2024).

Fresh Food Certification

Fresh food certification is a formal mechanism to ensure that food products meet established safety and quality standards. Certification serves to reduce information asymmetries between producers and consumers, protect public health, and increase market confidence. The scope of certification encompasses aspects of food safety, product quality, and, in its development, sustainability. In practice, certification is not only technical but also a strategic instrument for market access and increasing product competitiveness. Therefore, its success is largely determined by the credibility of the implementing agency and the effectiveness of the monitoring system (Donny & Kurniawan, 2023).

Fresh Food of Plant Origin (PSAT)

Fresh Food of Plant Origin (PSAT) certification is based on a national legal framework that emphasizes food safety and quality assurance. Technical regulations establish certification as formal proof that PSAT products have met safety and quality standards based on an implemented quality assurance system. At the regional level, PSAT certification has a strategic dimension as it is a crucial prerequisite for local agricultural products to enter modern markets, the tourism sector, and the broader distribution chain. Thus, PSAT certification serves as a consumer protection instrument and a lever for increasing the competitiveness of local products (Kurniawati et al., 2025).

Edward III Implementation Model

The Edward III implementation model identifies four key variables that determine the effectiveness of policy implementation: communication, resources, implementer disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Clarity and consistency of communication ensure a shared understanding of the policy. The

availability of resources is a prerequisite for policy implementation. Implementer disposition reflects bureaucrats' commitment and acceptance of the policy, while bureaucratic structure determines the smoothness of coordination and control. This model is operational and widely used to analyze public service performance, including certification policies.

Mazmanian and Sabatier Implementation Model

The Mazmanian and Sabatier model views policy implementation as a long-term process influenced by the characteristics of the problem, the statute's ability to structure implementation, and political and socioeconomic dynamics. This model emphasizes that implementation is iterative and involves a process of policy learning. The strength of this approach lies in its ability to link policy design, institutional capacity, and the external context within a single, integrated analytical framework (Subarsono, 2020).

The theoretical framework employed in this study is Edward III's Policy Implementation Model, which posits that the success of policy implementation is contingent upon four key variables: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The present study analyzes the implementation of the Fresh Plant-Based Products (PSAT) certification policy using the following four variables. The specific objectives are to examine the following: first, the manner in which applicable regulations are communicated to implementers and business actors; second, the availability of resources in the certification service; third, the attitudes and commitment of policy implementers; and fourth, the manner in which bureaucratic procedures and coordination are carried out in the certification process.

The utilization of Edward III's theory in this study functions not solely as a general conceptual framework but also as a direct application to elucidate the efficacy of the PSAT certification policy's implementation. This is due to the fact that the PSAT certification policy is a public service policy that is highly dependent on the effectiveness of policy communication, the availability of institutional resources, the commitment of implementing officials, and coordination among the agencies involved in the certification process.

In addition to employing policy implementation theory, this study is supported by relevant prior research, including studies conducted by Syamsuri et al. (2024), Mulyono and Hidayat (2022), Ningrum (2022), Salam and Makhtum (2022), Intania et al. (2023), Latifah (2022), Astiwara (2024), Triwendyarti et al. (2025), Rohimat et al. (2023), and Putri and Suprayoga (2023). A review of the extant literature reveals a wealth of research on product certification, including food certification, halal certification, and product certification policies in general. Consequently, the present study builds upon extant research by focusing on the implementation of PSAT certification service policies in Bali Province.

Research Gap

Previous studies on certification policy mainly focus on administrative and institutional aspects of policy implementation, such as resources, procedures, and service effectiveness. However, these studies have not sufficiently explained the relationship between policy implementation and market dynamics, particularly the economic value of certification for business actors.

This study addresses this gap by integrating the policy implementation perspective (Edward III) with a market-based approach, emphasizing that the effectiveness of PSAT certification is not only determined by institutional capacity but also by the ability of the policy to create economic incentives and added value in the market. This study develops a conceptual framework by integrating Edward III's Policy Implementation Model with a market-based perspective. The independent variables consist of

four key dimensions of policy implementation: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure.

3. Research Methods

Research Design

This research was conducted at the Regional Technical Implementation Unit of the Food Quality and Safety Certification Center (UPTD BSMKP), which is part of the Bali Provincial Agriculture and Food Security Agency. The selection of Bali Province as the research location was motivated by its status as a prominent tourism destination, necessitating the procurement of agricultural and food products that meet stringent quality and safety standards. Moreover, preliminary observations indicated that only a limited number of farmers, farmer groups, and business actors have obtained certification for their agricultural products, making this institution an appropriate locus for analyzing the implementation of the PSAT certification policy.

The present study employs a qualitative approach, utilizing a descriptive research design. The qualitative approach was selected to facilitate a comprehensive examination of the implementation process of the Fresh Food Certification Service Policy of Plant Origin at the UPTD BSMKP of Bali Province. The present study focuses on understanding the implementation process, the institutional dynamics, and the interaction between policy implementers and policy target groups. The research design is rooted in an intrinsic case study approach, as it meticulously examines the implementation of the policy within the institutional context of the UPTD BSMKP Bali. It is important to note that the intention is not to generalize the findings to other regions.

Research Subjects and Informants

The key informants in this study consisted of: The following individuals were included in the study: (1) the Head of the Bali Provincial Agriculture and Food Security Agency; (2) the Head of the UPTD Food Quality and Safety Certification Center; (3) the Head of the General and Personnel Sub-section of UPTD BSMKP; (4) the Certification Sub-Coordinator; (5) the Functional Supervisor of Agricultural Product Quality; and (6) two business actors representing the policy target group..

Data collection technique

The data presented herein were collected through three primary techniques: in-depth interviews, observation, and documentation. To this end, in-depth interviews were conducted with key informants who were directly involved in the implementation of the PSAT certification policy. The observation process was executed through the implementation of non-participant observation techniques, thereby facilitating direct observation of the certification service process, administrative procedures, and work dynamics at the UPTD BSMKP. Concurrently, documentation techniques were employed to gather secondary data, including policy documents, certification regulations, institutional performance reports, certification statistics, and other pertinent official records.

Data Analysis Techniques

Data analysis was carried out thematically with reference to the interactive model (Miles & Huberman, 2014), The data collection, data condensation, data presentation, and conclusion drawing are

included. In the data condensation stage, researchers coded and grouped data based on key themes relevant to the pentahelix collaborative governance framework, such as actor roles, collaboration mechanisms, power relations, and barriers to policy implementation. The data were then presented in an analytical narrative to identify patterns and relationships between categories. Conclusions were drawn iteratively by continuously checking the consistency of the findings against the empirical data obtained.

Data Validity and Validity

The data analysis in this study was conducted qualitatively using an interactive analysis model developed by Miles and Huberman. The analysis process was carried out in three stages: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing.

In the subsequent stage of data reduction, the collected data—including information from interviews, observations, and documentation—was meticulously selected, simplified, and classified according to the Edward III policy implementation framework. This comprehensive framework encompasses the following components: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The reduced data were subsequently presented in the form of analytical narratives, matrices, and tables to facilitate the identification of patterns and relationships between variables. The final stage entailed the formulation of conclusions through the identification of patterns, the testing of data consistency, and the continuous verification of the findings throughout the research process.

In order to ensure the validity and reliability of the findings, this study employed a variety of qualitative validation techniques. The validity of the data was reinforced through a combination of source triangulation, method triangulation, and time triangulation. Source triangulation entailed the comparison of information obtained from multiple informants. Method triangulation involved the comparison of data collected through interviews, observations, and documentation. Time triangulation involved conducting data collection at different times. Furthermore, member checking was carried out by confirming the results of the analysis with key informants to ensure that the interpretation of the data was accurate and in accordance with field conditions.

4. Results and Discussion

Certification Service Implementation Process and Mechanism

The formal implementation of the PSAT certification service policy at the Bali Province BSMKP Technical Implementation Unit (UPTD) has been conducted in accordance with established procedures. The service process includes administrative stages, field audits, laboratory testing, and Technical Commission meetings. However, when analyzed using Edward III's policy implementation theory, a gap is evident between policy design and field practice. From a communications perspective, the government has implemented outreach and digital innovation, but these communications have not been effective in building understanding and motivation among business actors. Low independent demand from business actors indicates that information transmission has not been able to generate market momentum for certification.

In terms of resources, limited budgets, infrastructure, information systems, and business capacity are key obstacles. These limitations result in slow processes, discrepancies during audits, and a lack of sustainable service innovation. In terms of disposition, implementing officials demonstrate commitment and a positive attitude towards maintaining service standards. However, business actors' dispositions tend to be negative and apathetic, as certification does not provide tangible economic incentives in the market. This difference in attitudes undermines the effectiveness of policy implementation.

From a bureaucratic perspective, the fragmentation of authority between district/city and provincial governments, as well as the involvement of numerous external actors, complicates coordination and consistency of service delivery. Despite the availability of standard operating procedures (SOPs), limited operational capacity often results in service time standards not being met.

Overall, the PSAT certification service process and mechanism have been running administratively, but its effectiveness is low because it is more oriented towards providing services (supply-side) without being balanced by the creation of demand and added value from the market side (demand-side).

The research findings indicate that the implementation of the Fresh Plant-Based Food (PSAT) certification policy at the Bali Provincial BSMKP Technical Implementation Unit has not been optimal. The ineffectiveness of this policy's implementation is attributable not only to technical service factors but also to the fact that the certification has not yet provided tangible economic value to market participants. The analysis of the research results was then systematically organized based on the four main variables in Edward III's policy implementation model: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure.

With regard to the dissemination of information regarding the PSAT certification policy, the research findings indicate that this information has not been distributed uniformly and consistently among business operators. The dissemination of information regarding the aforementioned policy has been restricted to specific business groups, resulting in a significant proportion of small business operators remaining unaware of the benefits and procedures associated with certification. This situation has engendered a paucity of interest among business operators in applying for certification, not merely due to onerous procedures, but because the information received has not been sufficient to raise awareness of the importance of certification in enhancing product competitiveness.

In terms of resources, the study determined that the UPTD BSMKP has sufficient fundamental resources; nevertheless, these resources have not yet been fully utilized to support a substantial increase in the number of certifications. The effectiveness of policy implementation is hindered by several factors, including limitations in the number of functional staff, budget constraints for outreach and assistance, and the suboptimal use of information technology. These conditions have resulted in a protracted certification process and have impeded its implementation among the entire target demographic of business operators covered by the policy.

In regard to disposition, the extant research findings indicate that policy implementers demonstrate a fairly strong commitment to implementing the PSAT certification policy. Conversely, business operators have not yet adopted a positive perception of certification. Some business operators posit that certification has not yet yielded tangible economic benefits, primarily because the local market has not yet made certification a primary requirement for the trade of fresh food products. This finding suggests that the primary challenges in policy implementation are not solely confined to service delivery processes, but are also influenced by the absence of a clearly defined economic value for certification within the market.

With respect to the bureaucratic structure, the study determined that the implementation of the PSAT certification policy has established operational procedures. However, the coordination among relevant agencies such as the agriculture department, the trade department, and the food safety oversight agencies has not yet functioned optimally. Consequently, the implementation of the certification policy continues to occur in a fragmented manner, lacking integration with policies designed to enhance the competitiveness of agricultural products. This indicates that, at present, certification has not yet had a substantial effect on enhancing product quality and market value.

The research findings indicate that the low number of PSAT certifications is not only due to administrative service issues but also because the certification lacks strong economic appeal in the market. Consequently, enhancing the implementation of policy necessitates not solely the improvement of services, but also the implementation of strategies that can augment the economic value of the certification for businesses.

The research findings indicate that poverty alleviation policies at the regional level have formally adopted a collaborative governance approach, involving various cross-sectoral actors, including local governments, the private sector, academics, community groups, and the mass media, in accordance with the pentahelix principle. The regional planning documents and program reports analyzed in this study affirm a normative commitment to building synergy between actors to reduce poverty and improve community welfare.

However, field findings show that this collaboration occurs more at the planning and administrative coordination levels, while at the program implementation and evaluation stages, work patterns are still dominated by government actors. This indicates a gap between collaborative policy design and actual implementation practices on the ground (policy-practice gap). This phenomenon aligns with the findings by [Lestari et al. \(2024\)](#) and [Akbar et al. \(2025\)](#) in the context of regional policy collaboration in Indonesia, which emphasizes that collaboration is often symbolic and not yet fully institutionalized.

In the perspective of collaborative governance by [Ansell & Gash \(2007\)](#), This condition indicates that the prerequisites for collaboration, such as a balance of power, initial trust (starting conditions), and incentives for participation, have not been fully met. The imbalance in roles between actors prevents the collaboration process from proceeding in a deliberative and equal manner, resulting in policy outputs still reflecting a conventional bureaucratic approach.

Table 1: Research Findings Based on Edward III Policy Implementation Model

Variable	Indicator	Research Findings	Evidence (Interview Quotation)	Analytical Interpretation
Communication	Policy socialization	Policy socialization has been conducted but has not reached all target groups evenly	“Socialization has been carried out, but not all business actors have participated, especially small farmers and small-scale enterprises.”	The communication process is still selective and has not created equal understanding among policy target groups. This condition affects the low participation of business actors in certification programs.
Communication	Clarity of information	Information regarding certification procedures is available but not widely understood	“The information about the certification process is already available, but many business actors still do not fully understand the requirements and procedures.”	The communication delivered has not yet been effective in building awareness of the importance of certification. Certification is still perceived as an administrative obligation rather than a strategic need.

Resources	Human resources	Implementing staff are available but still limited in number	"We already have officers who handle certification, but the number is still limited compared to the number of business actors who should be served."	Limited human resources reduce the intensity of assistance and mentoring, which directly affects the effectiveness of policy implementation.
Resources	Budget and facilities	Budget and supporting facilities are available but still limited for outreach and mentoring	"The budget is available, but it is still not sufficient to support wider socialization and field assistance."	Limited resources make the policy implementation unable to reach all target groups, especially small-scale business actors.
Disposition	Commitment of implementers	Implementing officers show strong commitment in carrying out the certification policy	"We are committed to encouraging business actors to obtain certification because it is important for food safety."	The problem of implementation does not lie in the commitment of implementers, but rather in external factors such as market response and business actor perceptions.
Disposition	Perception of business actors	Business actors do not yet perceive significant economic benefits from certification	"Certification does not directly increase the selling price of our products in the market."	This finding indicates that the main problem is not only the service process but also the absence of economic value of certification in the market.
Bureaucratic Structure	Service procedures	Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) are already available and implemented	"The procedures are already clear and we follow the SOP in the certification process."	The bureaucratic structure is relatively well established. However, good procedures alone are not sufficient to increase the number of certified products.
Bureaucratic Structure	Inter-agency coordination	Coordination among related institutions is not yet optimal	"Coordination with other related institutions is still limited, so the certification program is not fully integrated."	Weak coordination causes the policy to run partially and reduces its effectiveness in improving product competitiveness.

Source: Author's analysis based on primary research data, 2025.

The discussion's outcomes are fortified through the implementation of qualitative visualization, manifesting as a word cloud. The word cloud is generated from keywords that most frequently appear during interviews with seven key informants. It reflects the real perception of policy implementation rather than only administrative data. The findings indicate that the primary challenges encountered during the implementation of PSAT certification in Bali Province are not exclusively associated with service quality. Rather, they are systemic issues that pertain to institutional capacity and the market value of certification itself.

Table 2. Synthesis of Word Cloud Results in the Implementation of PSAT Certification

Main Theme	Dominant Keywords in Word Cloud	Interpretation of Findings	Policy Implication
Policy Orientation	Certification, Target, Process	Certification is still oriented toward administrative targets rather than market demand	Policy needs to shift from target-based to market-based implementation
Target Group Condition	Business actors, Farmers, Assistance	Business actors are the main focus but still lack technical and administrative capacity	Strengthening mentoring programs and technical assistance is essential
Institutional Constraints	Budget, System, Manual, Data	Institutional capacity is weak, especially in funding, digital systems, and administrative processes	Institutional strengthening is the main prerequisite for improving policy effectiveness
Service Effectiveness	Time, Procedure, Documentation	Bureaucratic procedures are still complex and inefficient	Service simplification and digital integration are urgently needed
Market Problem	Market, Price, Added Value	Certification does not provide economic value in the market	The main problem lies not only in service but in the absence of market incentives
External Pressure	Imported products, Competition, Retail	Local certified products are not competitive compared to imported products	Government intervention is needed to create market protection for certified products
Business Actors' Perception	Value, Benefit, Demand, Consumers	Business actors do not see the real benefits of certification	Policy communication must emphasize economic benefits rather than administrative compliance
Policy Weakness	Regulation, Coordination, Fragmentation	Regulations already exist but are not fully implemented in the market	Policy implementation must be strengthened through inter-agency coordination

Source: Author's analysis based on primary research data, 2025.

Data-Based Service Output and Performance Achievement

The output and performance of PSAT certification services demonstrate a paradox between administrative targets and policy impacts. Quantitatively, the number of certifications issued tends to be low and has declined significantly in recent years. The large gap between agricultural production volume and the number of certified products indicates low certification adoption at the business level.

This decline in output is closely related to resource variables, particularly the loss of budget support when the certification policy changed from mandatory to voluntary. Pressure to meet administrative targets encouraged a proactive approach, but it failed to address the low structural demand from business actors. In terms of process performance, the standard maximum service time of 60 days was often not met. Obstacles stemmed from business actors' lack of understanding and low urgency, limited human resources, dependence on external Technical Commissions, and the complexity of the bureaucratic structure involving numerous stages and actors.

In terms of service quality, although the Community Satisfaction Index showed a fairly good rating, complaints persisted regarding costs, facilities, an unintegrated administrative system, and a lack of technical assistance. The absence of development programs such as field schools has resulted in businesses being less prepared to meet certification standards.

At the outcome level, PSAT certification has not yet provided perceived economic added value to business actors. Certified products lack price differentiation or improved market access. The market's failure to value certification has caused it to lose its function as a quality signal, ultimately reinforcing business apathy.

While simple technology-based innovations have been implemented to improve service efficiency, they have not significantly improved performance because they are not supported by fundamental resource and structural improvements. Consequently, overall policy performance is considered low because the resulting administrative outputs are not translated into economic outcomes and product competitiveness in the market.

Internal Obstacles to the Implementation of PSAT Certification

The findings of this study indicate that the implementation of the Fresh Food Certification Policy of Plant Origin (PSAT) in Bali Province is still constrained by structural institutional weaknesses. The findings of the qualitative analysis, which were further substantiated by the implementation of a word cloud visualization, indicated that the predominant keywords were budget, system, procedures, data, and manual services. These results reflect the prevailing concern regarding the institution's limited capacity rather than mere technical service constraints.

The predominance of the term "budget" underscores the pervasive impact of financial constraints on various facets of policy implementation, encompassing mentoring programs, service facilities, operational expenses, and digital system development. This condition became more evident after the termination of government funding, which resulted in a shift from mandatory certification to a voluntary certification program. Consequently, the financial responsibility for certification costs was shifted to business actors, leading to a decline in their participation.

Furthermore, the recurrent utilization of terms such as "system," "manual," and "data" signifies that the certification service system remains rooted in administrative conventions and lacks comprehensive integration into a digital infrastructure. Despite the integration of digital innovation, the service process remains contingent on manual administration, fragmented data, and bureaucratic procedures that are comparatively intricate. This finding indicates that the effectiveness of policy implementation is significantly influenced by the limited availability of institutional resources, particularly financial resources, infrastructure, and information systems.

These findings are consistent with Edward III's policy implementation theory, which emphasizes that policy effectiveness is determined by the availability of resources and the effectiveness of bureaucratic structures. In the context of PSAT certification, the dearth of institutional resources exerts a direct influence on the quality of service delivery and curtails the capacity of implementing agencies to attain policy objectives.

The implementation of PSAT certification in Bali Province faces interrelated internal challenges, particularly in institutional aspects, resources, procedures, and bureaucratic work systems. The primary obstacle is limited financial resources, resulting from the cessation of government funding, which shifted certification from a mandatory to a voluntary program. Consequently, business participation declined, certification costs were shifted to businesses, and service facilities and infrastructure became inadequate.

Furthermore, there are human resource and technical capacity constraints, particularly among micro and small businesses, who struggle to meet technical and administrative standards. The suspension of mentoring programs such as field schools widens the gap between certification standards and business capacity.

Complex and rigid bureaucratic procedures also pose obstacles, characterized by a manual, unintegrated administrative system and fragmented authority between provinces and districts/cities. This situation creates confusion, inefficiency, and service delays. In terms of information systems and technology, existing digital innovations are suboptimal due to the lack of real-time process tracking mechanisms and the low digital literacy of business actors. All of these obstacles are exacerbated by the bureaucratic work culture and disposition of implementers, including dependence on external parties such as the Technical Commission, which has limited time, thus slowing down the decision-making process.

External Constraints: Business Actors' Perceptions and Market Dynamics

A salient finding of this study is the predominance of external constraints over internal ones. The results of the word cloud analysis indicate that the most frequently appearing keywords related to external problems are market, price, added value, retail, competition, and imported products.

These findings suggest that the primary impediment to the implementation of PSAT certification does not exclusively stem from the quality of public services. Rather, it is primarily attributable to the absence of economic incentives within the market. A comparative analysis reveals that certified products exhibit no significant disparities in terms of price, product placement, or consumer perception when compared to non-certified products. Consequently, business actors do not perceive certification as an instrument that can increase competitiveness or economic benefits.

The recurrent utilization of the terms "price" and "added value" serves to substantiate the tendency among business actors to adopt a rational approach. In instances where certification does not result in increased product prices or market access, there is a concomitant decline in the motivation of these entities to engage in certification programs. This condition is further exacerbated by unfavorable market dynamics, particularly the presence of cheaper imported products and the limited commitment of modern retailers to prioritize certified local products.

This finding serves to reinforce the argument that the issue of policy implementation is not exclusively situated on the supply side, which pertains to service delivery, but is also present on the demand side, which refers to market acceptance. Consequently, enhancing the efficacy of policy implementation cannot be exclusively dependent on administrative service enhancements; it is imperative to employ strategies that will generate market demand for certified products.

External constraints are a crucial factor, even more powerful than internal constraints. Businesses widely view PSAT certification as providing no real economic added value, as certified products are not differentiated in price or placement in the modern market.

Business actors have become apathetic and economically rational, as products continue to sell without certification and receive no price premiums. This situation is exacerbated by unfavorable market dynamics, where modern retailers and consumers do not yet appreciate food safety attributes, and by strong competition from cheaper and more visually appealing imported products.

Collaborative efforts with modern retailers to require certification for suppliers have proven effective in encouraging certification applications, but remain limited. Furthermore, there is a misalignment between regional regulations (Gubernatorial Regulation No. 99 of 2018) and market practices, resulting in suboptimal absorption of certified local products.

Recommendations for Strengthening Institutional and Service Capacity

A synthesis of word cloud results indicates a clear correlation between implementation problems and the four variables of Edward III:

Table 3. Summary of Research Findings in the Perspective of Theoretical Framework

Edward III Variable	Word Cloud Evidence	Main Finding
Communication	Market, benefit, demand, value	Policy communication has not succeeded in creating market demand
Resources	Budget, system, data, facilities	Institutional resources are still limited
Disposition	Value, benefit, price, market	Business actors become apathetic because certification has no economic value
Bureaucratic Structure	Target, procedures, manual, coordination	Bureaucratic implementation is still procedural and target-oriented

Source: Author’s analysis based on primary research data, 2025.

The findings of this study can be systematically explained using Edward III’s policy implementation framework, which includes four main variables: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The synthesis of qualitative findings, based on the word cloud results, demonstrates a strong relationship between these four variables and the effectiveness of PSAT certification implementation.

First, in the domain of communication, the results indicate that policy communication has not yet succeeded in building a strong understanding among business actors regarding the economic benefits of certification. The prevailing communication paradigm continues to be characterized by administrative messages rather than market-oriented benefits, resulting in suboptimal participation from the intended demographic.

Secondly, within the resource dimension, constrained budgets, deficient facilities, and inadequate digital systems substantially impede the capacity of implementing agencies to deliver effective services. This finding indicates that the availability of resources is a pivotal factor in determining the success of policy implementation.

Thirdly, within the context of the disposition dimension, the perception among business actors that certification offers no tangible economic benefits has been shown to engender apathy and diminish participation. This condition suggests that the success of policy implementation is significantly influenced by the attitudes and perceptions of the target group.

Fourthly, from the perspective of bureaucratic structure, the presence of complex procedures, fragmented authority between provincial and district governments, and manual administrative systems contributes to inefficiency in policy implementation. This condition indicates that while the policy has been implemented procedurally, it has yet to be implemented effectively.

To improve the effectiveness of the policy, it is recommended to strengthen the institutional capacity of the UPTD BSMKP through sustainable budgeting for technical assistance and partial subsidies for small business actors, improvement of facilities and infrastructure to support service quality, digitalization of an integrated, transparent, and easily accessible certification information system, then improvement of policy communication that emphasizes economic benefits and success stories, then increasing human resource capacity and cross-agency coordination, and integration of certification services in a one-stop system to simplify procedures.

Theoretically, the results of this study enrich the study of collaborative governance by emphasizing the importance of integrating a policy implementation perspective in the analysis of multi-actor collaboration. These findings indicate that the success of collaboration is determined not only by institutional design, but also by actor capacity, power relations, and the local bureaucratic context. Practically, this study provides implications for local governments in designing more effective poverty alleviation

policies. Strengthening joint decision-making mechanisms, increasing the capacity of non-governmental actors, and reforming more adaptive bureaucratic procedures are important prerequisites for closing the gap between policy design and implementation practices. Thus, the results and discussion of this study confirm that the pentahelix collaborative governance approach has great potential in poverty alleviation, but its effectiveness depends heavily on the extent to which such collaboration can be substantively institutionalized in policy practice at the local level.

Business Empowerment and Market Development Strategy

The primary contribution of this study is the observation that the implementation of PSAT certification in Bali Province is predominantly driven by administrative logic rather than market logic. The policy has been implemented procedurally; however, it has yet to function as an economic instrument capable of increasing the competitiveness of agricultural products.

This finding distinguishes this study from previous research, which generally focuses on service effectiveness or policy compliance. The present study demonstrates that the primary issue is the absence of economic value generated by certification within the market. Absent price differentiation, product branding, or market incentives, certification is often perceived as merely an administrative obligation rather than a strategic instrument for enhancing product competitiveness.

Consequently, enhancing the efficacy of policy implementation necessitates an integrated approach encompassing the reinforcement of institutional capacity, the enhancement of service quality, the empowerment of business actors, and the cultivation of a market system that acknowledges the value of certified products.

Institutional strengthening needs to be complemented by market development strategies through (1) Regulation and collaboration with retailers, hotels, and restaurants to create mandatory demand; (2) Efficient and sustainable commodity cluster-based mentoring; (3) Creating branding and differentiation of certified products through collective labels and consumer education; and (4) Facilitating access to high-value markets, such as export, hospitality, and e-commerce markets.

The main obstacle to implementing PSAT certification in Bali lies in a combination of internal institutional weaknesses and a market environment that lacks economic incentives. Therefore, improving policy effectiveness must be implemented systematically by integrating institutional capacity building, business empowerment, and the creation of a market that values certified products. This approach is expected to transform certification from an administrative burden into a strategic instrument for increasing the competitiveness of Bali's PSAT products.

5. Conclusion

The objective of this study is to analyze the effectiveness of the implementation of the Fresh Food Certification Service Policy of Plant Origin (PSAT) at the UPTD BSMKP of Bali Province based on Edward III's policy implementation framework. The results indicate that the policy has been implemented procedurally, yet its efficacy remains to be ascertained.

1. The implementation of PSAT certification has been carried out through a clearly delineated administrative framework, including various certification schemes and standardized service procedures. Nevertheless, its effectiveness remains limited, as evidenced by the declining number of certifications, the inability to consistently meet service time standards, and the absence of sustainable mentoring programs. This finding indicates that the implementation process continues to prioritize administrative objectives over actual demand from business actors.

2. The primary impediments to the implementation of policy are multifaceted, comprising both inherent institutional deficiencies and external market limitations. The primary challenges encountered within the organization are characterized by constrained financial resources, deficient infrastructure and information systems, and intricate operational procedures. Externally, the most salient obstacle is the perception of business actors that certification does not provide real economic value in the market. Certified products do not exhibit significant price or market access differentiation, which has been demonstrated to reduce business actors' motivation to participate in certification programs.
3. The efficacy of PSAT certification cannot be enhanced solely through the refinement of services. The findings of this study substantiate the notion that the efficacy of policy implementation necessitates an integrated approach, entailing the consolidation of institutional fortification, the empowerment of business entities, and the establishment of a market that acknowledges the value of certified products. Absent market incentives, certification will persist in being regarded as an administrative obligation rather than a strategic instrument for increasing product competitiveness.

In light of the findings of this study, the following concrete and operational policy recommendations can be proposed:

1. The Bali Provincial Government must enhance institutional capacity by allocating a stable and sustainable budget in the Regional Budget (APBD) specifically for the PSAT certification program. The budget should be used to improve service facilities, strengthen the operational capacity of the UPTD BSMKP, and finance continuous mentoring programs for micro and small business actors.
2. The UPTD BSMKP must expedite the digital transformation of certification services by developing an integrated online system that facilitates online submission, real-time status tracking, and automatic service notifications. Furthermore, the streamlining of service procedures is imperative to curtail administrative complexity and expedite processing times.
3. The government must strengthen business empowerment through mentoring programs based on commodity clusters. This mentoring should not only focus on technical requirements but also on improving business actors' capacity to access modern markets and increase product competitiveness.
4. The efficacy of policy implementation must be reinforced by establishing a market for certified products. To address this, the government should promulgate additional operational regulations that incentivize modern retailers, hotels, and restaurants to prioritize the procurement of certified local products. Furthermore, the government must facilitate collaboration between business actors and market institutions through business matching programs and the development of collective branding for certified products.
5. To enhance the efficacy of PSAT certification, a multifaceted approach is imperative, entailing the consolidation of institutional fortification, the empowerment of business entities, and the establishment of a market ecosystem that fosters the adoption of certified products. It is imperative to recognize that this integrated approach is instrumental in ensuring that certification fulfills its dual role, functioning not only as an administrative prerequisite but also as a strategic instrument that can effectively augment the competitiveness of agricultural products in Bali Province.

This study confirms that the implementation of poverty alleviation policies based on pentahelix collaborative governance at the regional level still faces a significant gap between normative policy

design and implementation practices. Although regional policies have formally adopted the principle of multi-actor collaboration, empirical practice shows that local governments remain the dominant actors in policy planning and implementation, while the involvement of the private sector, academics, civil society, and the media remains administrative in nature and has not been substantively institutionalized. The findings of this study confirm that the collaborative process has not yet developed into a deliberative and sustainable decision-making mechanism as required by the collaborative governance framework. Weak cross-actor communication, limited resources, a low bureaucratic disposition to share authority, and a hierarchical bureaucratic structure are the main factors explaining the gap in policy implementation. As a result, the resulting poverty alleviation policies tend to be oriented towards short-term programs and have not been able to encourage sustainable poverty reduction.

This study has several limitations. First, the focus on a single regional context limits the generalizability of the findings, while the use of a qualitative approach does not allow for quantitative measurement of the impact of pentahelix collaboration on poverty reduction. Second, limited access to internal data from non-governmental actors limits in-depth analysis of collaboration dynamics. Therefore, future research is recommended to develop cross-regional comparative studies and use a mixed methods approach to combine analysis of collaborative processes with policy impact measurement. Further research should also highlight the role of facilitative leadership and mechanisms for institutionalizing collaboration as key factors in bridging the gap between policy design and implementation practices.

6. References

- Astiawara, EM (2024). Mandatory Halal 2024 for Food MSMEs: Readiness and Adaptation Strategies. *Journal of Social and Economics Research*, 6(2).
- Creswell, JW (2017). *Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Student Library.
- Donny, A., & Kurniawan, B. (2023). Evaluation of the Implementation of the Halal Product Assurance Certification Policy in Encouraging the Development of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises Post-COVID-19. *Publika*, 11(2).
- Edwards III, C. G. (1980). *Implementing Public Policy*. Congressional Quarterly Inc.
- Government of Indonesia. (2012). Law Number 18 of 2012 concerning food. Jakarta: Government of the Republic of Indonesia.
- Government of Indonesia. (2019). Government Regulation Number 86 of 2019 concerning food safety. Jakarta: Government of the Republic of Indonesia.
- Government of Bali Province. (2018). Governor Regulation of Bali Province Number 99 of 2018 concerning local agricultural product protection policies. Denpasar: Government of Bali Province.
- Intania, E., Rahayu, S., Putri, T., & Arma, A. (2023). Implementation of Communication-Based Halal Certification Policy for Community Business Products in Jayanti Village. *GOVERNANCE: Scientific Journal of Local Politics and Development Studies*, 10(2).
- Kurniawati, E., Handoko, VR, & Widodo, J. (2025). Implementation of the Seed Certification Program at the Department of Agriculture and Food Security of East Java Province. *Journal of Government Studies (JKP)*, 11(2).
- Latifah, U. (2022). Mandatory Halal Certification Policy for Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises Products in Kudus Regency. *JIOSE: Journal of Indonesian Sharia Economics*, 1(1), 41–58.

- Meter, DS , Van, & Horn, CE Van. (1975). The Policy Implementation Process: A Conceptual Framework. *Administration & Society*, 6(4), 445–488.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Indonesia. (2018). Regulation of the Minister of Agriculture Number 53 of 2018 concerning fresh food safety certification of plant origin. Jakarta: Ministry of Agriculture.
- Muhram, LO, Dewi, AL, Yusuf, NY, Kurniati, W. ode intan, Yusuf, M., Supriadi, S., & Muthalib, DA (2022). Implementation of Conservation Policy for Livestock Conservation on Animal Health and Feed in South Konawe Regency. *Journal of Community Service Work*, 2(05), 186–196. <https://doi.org/10.62668/berkarya.v2i05.790>
- Mulyono, A., & Hidayat, YR (2022). Implementation of Halal Certification Policy in Indonesia. *Res Publica: Journal of Social Policy Issues*, 1(1).
- Ningrum, RTP (2022). Problems of Halal Certification Obligations for Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs) in Madiun Regency. *Istithmar: Journal of Sharia Economic Studies*, 6(1), 43–58.
- Puri, WP, & Muslim, A. (2023). Analysis of Factors Influencing the Implementation of Risk-Based Business Licensing Policies Through the Online Single Submission (OSS) System in the Issuance of Food Production Commitment Fulfillment Standards for Home Industry (SPP-IRT). *Journal of Public Administration and Policy (JAKP)*, 8(2). <https://doi.org/10.25077/jakp>
- Putri, NA, & Suprayoga. (2023). Implementation of Stunting Reduction Policy in Surabaya City (Bubutan District Study). *Journal of Public Sector Innovation*, 3(3).
- Rayhan, A., Nizar, AS, & Lalarawalata, J. (2024). Implementation of Sustainable Food Crop Land Protection Policy to Strengthen Food Security in Banten Province. *Journal of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University*, 1(1).
- Rohimat, A., Dwiputrianti, S., Pratiwi, A., Abdullah, S., & Afandi, MN (2023). Implementation of Veterinary Control Number (NKV) Certification as an Effort to Improve the Quality of Animal Products in West Bandung Regency. *National Conference on Administrative Sciences*, 7(1).
- Salam, DQA, & Makhtum, A. (2022). Implementation of Halal Product Assurance Through Halal Certification for Food and Beverage Products of MSMEs in Sampang Regency. *Qawwam: The Leader's Writing*, 3(1).
- Sumaryanto, B. (2025). The Need for a Change in Approach in the Implementation of Law No. 33 of 2014 Concerning Halal Product Assurance: A Public Policy Product That Needs to be Reviewed? *Journal of Community Service and Educational Research*, 4(1), 7090–7097. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jerkin.v4i1.2861>
- Syamsuri, H., Parakkasi, I., & Muthiadin, C. (2024). Food Industry Transformation Through the Halal Food Law: Effective Management of the Halal Assurance System. *Scientific Journal of Business and Entrepreneurship*, 13(3). <https://e-jurnal.nobel.ac.id/index.php/jbk>
- Triwendyarti, M., Prihana, E., & Syarkani, Y. (2025). Home Industry (SPP-IRT) at the Cianjur District Health Office. *Journal of Governance and Public Policy*, 1(1).
- Widianti, A., Kurniati, K., & Mustafa, Z. (2025). Implementation of Halal Certification Policy and Its Implications for Business Sustainability in Restaurants and Cafes in Singkawang City. *JIOSE: Journal of Indonesian Sharia Economics*, 4(2), 109–124. <https://doi.org/10.35878/jiose.v4i2.1735>.